Taste and terroir in France

Food products, taste and the geographical indications
A comparative study with Korea
Benjamin Joinau
26th June 2013
신토불이 = terroir?

But what is the relation to the taste?
Plan

I. What is terroir?
II. Why is it necessary to protect the terroirs?
III. How to protect the terroirs? The indications, labels, certifications.
IV. A case study: sel de Guérande
V. Other cases: the different strategies between commercial obligations and taste
VI. Applying to Korean context
Chapter I

What is terroir?
France is a mosaic of terroirs.
Centralisation → Regional diversity

Awareness of « terroir » → Local differences
Second wave of terroir awareness

- 19th century industrialisation of agriculture and alimentation
- Frauds growing with competition
- Local producers of wine start to get aware of the necessity to gather and protect their specificities
- Starts with wine
The elements of terroir and the relation to the product

- Place
- Climate
- Soil
- History
- People
- Know-how

Product
Chapter II

Why is it necessary to protect the terroir?
Why is it necessary to protect the terroir?
Why is it necessary to protect the terroir?

1. Protect a product & a technique
2. Protect the producers and their profession
3. Protect the consumer
4. Protect the cultural diversity
5. Protect the environmental diversity
6. Protect the quality of the product
7. Expand a market
8. Reinforce local cultural identity
9. Boost local economy and tourism
10. AND THE TASTE OF COURSE!
Chapter III

How to protect the terroir?
A body of legal protection

- Gouvernemental and private initiatives
- National and European systems

1. The environmental labels
2. The taste and production quality labels
3. The international certifications
4. The geographical indications
5. The valorizing labels
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Taste and production quality</th>
<th>French Government</th>
<th>French Private initiative</th>
<th>EU/International</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Label Rouge</td>
<td>Nature et Progrès</td>
<td>Spécialité Traditionelle Garantie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AB (Agriculture bio)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Organic Agriculture Label Demeter (private)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Site Remarquable du Goût</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geographic indication (origin products)</th>
<th>French Government</th>
<th>French Private initiative</th>
<th>EU/International</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AOC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>AOP PGI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Produits pays</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vins de pays</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Valorising labels</th>
<th>French Government</th>
<th>French Private initiative</th>
<th>EU/International</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Montagne</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fermier, produit à la ferme</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Produits de la ferme (Bienvenue à la ferme)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Certifications</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>ISO 9001 IFS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
III-1. The environmental labels

- French level
  - Label « Paysage » (Landscape)
  - Site of Special Ecological Interest (ZNIEFF)
  - Bird Protection Area (ZICO) under the 1979 European directive on “Birds”

- International / EU level
  - Wetlands of international importance under the RAMSAR convention
  - European « Natura 2000 » network
A. Between environment and taste: « Remarkable sites of taste » label

- a label recognizing the ecosystem
- and superior quality of the product
- valorised through the welcoming of tourists.
B. « Nature et Progrès » label: guarantees organic agriculture

- Associative initiative in 1964 (first in world)
- Recognised by government in 1986
- Guarantee of environmentally friendly agricultural practices
- Integrate environment, humans and economy: holistic approach of ecology
- Implies consumers as well
- Independent body (non corporatist association)
- Can replace the “A.B.” label (organic farming)
III-2. Labelling taste and modes of production

C. « A.B. (Agriculture Biologique) » label: guarantees organic agriculture

- Since 1985
- Under EU system since 2009

Korean Equivalents:
III-2. Labelling taste and modes of production

D. « Label rouge » or Red Label
- Since 1960. 45 000 producers, 6000 companies.
- Not only for French or EU products.

- official sign of superior quality food product
- conform to specifications
- distinct from similar standard products, given as a reference (comparative approach)

- independent certifying body approved by the Ministry of Agriculture.

- inspections of physical composition, but also inspection of organoleptic quality (taste, smell, appearance, etc.) by a jury, regularly,

- Case under the management of a group of operators: ODG – Organisme Défense et Gestion.

- also importance of presentation, image, service.
III-2. Labelling taste and modes of production

E. Traditional Speciality Guaranteed (STG)

- EU, since 1992
- Not related to origine or terroir, but to a tradition.
- Ex: mozzarella, serrano ham, pizza napoletana...
- Distinctive function: to differentiate product from others in the same category.
- Tradition: consistency for a minimum of 30 years.
- This registered trade sign can be used commonly by producers respecting the specifications.

- Korean quasi equivalent:
  Traditional food

Differences: private, individual producers, not a common usage. Not distinctive. Not related to time but to technique.
III-2. Labelling taste and modes of production

F. Label Demeter

Biodynamics: organic agriculture taking into account stars influence and a holistic conception of nature.

1927: creation of cooperative in Germany
1997: creation of Demeter International

No Korean equivalent
III-3. The international certifications

- ISO 9001
  Control over all its storage, sifting, transformation, packing, marketing and dispatching activities.

- IFS (International Food Standard) Certification Initiative of French and German distributors, designed to ensure food safety

- Korean equivalents:
  - KS certified processed food
  - Agricultural products traceability system
  - Good Agricultural Practices (GAP)
III-4. The geographical indications

• What are Geographical Indications (GI)?

A. Examples:

- Champagne wine, Port wine, Roquefort cheese, Jerez vinegar, Parmigiano cheese, Provence olive oil (Europe)...

- Colombian coffee, Pisco (Peru), Nuoc Mam Phu Quok (Vietnam)...)
III-4. The geographical indications

• What are Geographical indications?

B. A concept existing in Korea

Korean GIs listed in Trade Agreement with EU (2009)
+ list of KPGI from 2002

- Boseong Green Tea
- Hadong Green Tea
- Gochang Black Raspberry Wine
- Seosan Garlic
- Yeongyang Red Pepper Powder
- Uiseong Garlic
- Geosan Dried Red Pepper
- Sunchang Traditional Gochujang
- Etc.
III-4. The geographical indications

- What are Geographical indications?

C. WTO (World Trade Organisation) definition

- Identify a good as originating in the territory where a given quality, reputation or other characteristics of the good is essentially attributable to its geographical origin

- Includes Appellation of Origin (AOC), a concept born in France

- Geographical origin: natural and/or human factors
III-4. The geographical indications

- What are Geographical indications?

D. Intellectual Property Right for all WTO members

- It is a distinctive sign
- It is a collective right of use
- Usually good is defined through technical standards (specification): characteristic of the product, method of production, link with place of origin, history, inspection procedures...
- In Europe, official inspection body or independent inspection body recognised by the State
- Rights against duties: comply with specification including controls!
III-4. The geographical indications

- What are Geographical indications?

F. Functions of G.I.

- To provide information to the consumers on the origin of the product
- To confer a form of protection to an intellectual property right to producers
- To contribute towards local development
- To preserve the ecosystems
III-4. The geographical indications

- The different types of G.I. in E.U.

- Protected Geographical Indication (PGI) (지리적표시보호)

- Protected Designation of Origin (PDO) (원산지명칭보호)
  - in France: Appellation d’Origine Contrôlée (AOC), created in France in 1905-1935, now AOP
  - Produits pays (French overseas territories)
  - Vins de pays (in France)
III-4. The geographical indications

- The different types of G.I. in E.U.
  - Protected Geographical Indication (PGI) (지리적표시보호)
    - Geographical origin
    - Quality and reputation
    - Linked to that origin
    - With a production in that geographical area
  - Group of coherent elements:
    - History
    - Know-how
    - Human culture
    - Local ressources
      - Material, cultural and historical dimensions
  - A sign of origin, but also of quality in time
  - Importance of local solidarities: all the operators and suppliers should be involved. Not only a « recipe ».
  - The demanding group (ODG) should imply all actors democratically.
  - Control by independant and certified bodies.
From the terroir to the product of a PGI or AOP
III-4. The geographical indications

- The different types of G.I. in E.U.

- Appellation d’Origine Contrôlée (AOC), created in France in 1905-1935, now AOP
- Agricultural products, raw or transformed whose qualities are determined by:
  - Geographical environment: natural and human factors
  - Reputation
  - Geographical area as place of production
  - Importance to the name (rights of trademark) but collective patrimoine (not individual or private).
  - Every producer meeting the specifications can use it
  - Protection against frauds and development projects
  - Managed by a « ODG »: collective body.
  - Importance of collective work for recognition as AOP, and question of relevance and legitimacy of application.
PDOs and PGIs by type of product in Europe 12.10.2007 (wine excluded)

PDO: Protected Designation of Origin, AOP in France
III-4. The geographical indications

- The Korean equivalent: KGPI

- Started after WTO definition of GI in 1995
- First KGPI in 2002: Boseong Green tea
- In 2013: 87 products
- + Korean GIs listed in Trade Agreement with EU (2009) – different products...
- Differences with PGI and AOP:
  - Individual candidates possible
  - Organoleptic tastes
III-5. The valorizing labels

- Label « Montagne » (Mountain)

- Label « Bienvenue à la ferme » (Welcome to the farm) and « Produit de la ferme » (Farmhouse product).

- Appellations « produit à la ferme » (produced in the farmhouse) and « fermier » (from the farmhouse).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th><strong>French Government</strong></th>
<th><strong>French Private initiative</strong></th>
<th><strong>EU/International</strong></th>
<th><strong>Korea</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Taste and production quality</strong></td>
<td>Label Rouge</td>
<td>Nature et Progrès</td>
<td>Spécialité Traditionelle Garantie</td>
<td>Traditional food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AB (Agriculture bio)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Organic Agriculture Label Demeter (private)</td>
<td>Organic, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Site Remarquable du Goût</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Geographic indication (origin products)</strong></td>
<td>AOC</td>
<td></td>
<td>AOP PGI</td>
<td>KGPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Produits pays</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vins de pays</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Valorising labels</strong></td>
<td>Montagne</td>
<td>Fermier, produit à la ferme</td>
<td></td>
<td>Private labels: Yangyang songi pine mushroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Produits de la ferme</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Bienvenue à la ferme)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Certifications</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>ISO 9001 IFS</td>
<td></td>
<td>KS certified processed food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Agricultural products traceability system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Good Agricultural Practices (GAP)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Differences France/Korea

- In Korea, a strong initiative from the central government following WTO and EU regulations for the KPGIs
- And at the same time, a lot of individual, private local initiatives not recognized nor controlled on a government level
- ➞ more synergy between government, local producers, cooperatives, local governments and consumers needed?
- In KPGIs and Traditional food certifications, the historical, human and social (public as opposed to individual), cooperative and patrimonial dimension of GI neglected. The « terroir » is seen almost only as a place (soil and climate) associated to techniques: very materialistic approach of terroir. No real « sustainability » without the human dimension.
- Most of KPGIs are raw products (fruits and vegetables) and are even rarely local breeds (generic breeds).
- KPGI’s and Traditional food open to groups as limited companies. Very different from the associative, corporatist approach of OGD.
- Independant bodies of testing, analysis, control?
- TASTE is forgotten in the analysis and tastes for certification!
From Website of Ministry of Agriculture
Information on different products according to origin
Chapter IV

A case study: Sea Salt of Guérande
IV-1. A specific product

- A. Guérande salt marshes are in Southern Brittany, France: a unique ecosystem
IV-1. A specific product

B. Historical « depth »

C. Specific harvesting techniques shared by community of salt workers: tides and three types of ponds, daily harvesting, absence of mechanisation,…

D. Salt workers grouped together in a cooperative, small-scale businesses

- A unique geographical and geological location, combined with a highly demanding view of the job, have given rise to a natural product that is proud of its quality: Guérande Salt!
IV-2. Recognition earned in different steps:

- **STEP 1**
  - Gastronomic recognition by famous chefs
  - Labelling
  - Distribution system in hypermarkets
  - Diversification of products (perfumed salts, herbs, etc.)
IV-2. Recognition in different steps

- Step 2: environmental labelling
  - Label « Paysage » (Landscape): salt marshes on the Guérande peninsula, since 1992
  - Site of Special Ecological Interest (ZNIEFF), since 1991
  - Bird Protection Area (ZICO) under the 1979 European directive on “Birds”.
  - Wetlands of international importance under the RAMSAR convention, since 1995
  - European « Natura 2000 » network
IV-2. Recognition earned in different steps:

- **STEP 3: Quality labellisation**

  - Label Rouge : 1991
  - for coarse salt and ground (fine) salt: official sign of superior quality food product
  - independent certifying body approved by the Ministry of Agriculture.
  - inspections of magnesium and other minerals; organoleptic quality
IV-2. Recognition earned in different steps:

- **STEP 4: Quality of environment labellisation**
  
  - Nature & Progrès label : 1989
    
    guarantee of environmentally friendly agricultural practices, replaces the “A.B.” label (organic farming)
  
  - "Remarkable Sites of the Taste “ Label:
    
    a label recognizing the ecosystem and superior quality of the product valorised trough the welcoming of tourists
IV-2. Recognition earned in different steps:

- STEP 5: International certifications
  - ISO 9001: 2008
    Control over all its storage, sifting, transformation, packing, marketing and dispatching activities.
  - IFS (International Food Standard) Certification: December 2006
    Initiative of French and German distributors, designed to ensure food safety.
IV-2. Recognition earned in different steps:

- **STEP 6: Geographical Indications**

- Eligibility of salt to be protected under EU regulation:

  «Salt is a high-quality foodstuff, the characteristics of which are closely linked to the geographical area of production and the local methods used to obtain it. The production of salt contributes to the economic and social development of several regions.»
IV-2. Recognition earned in different steps:

- STEP 6: Geographical Indications

- Application of a Protected Geographical Indication in France (AOP), under process,

- and then in Europe (IGP) for « fleur de sel »
www.universsel.org

Soutenez-nous !
Pourquoi et comment ?

YANNICK NOAH
soutient UNIVERS SEL

©2008 Univers Sel - Mentions légales - Réalisation : SQLI
Chapter V

Other cases: the different strategies between commercial obligations and taste.
1 Camembert cheese
2 Roquefort vs Reblochon
3 Patta negra di belotta vs Bayonne ham
4 The case of wines
   - Different appellations
   - Example of Beaujolais wines
AOP Camembert

- AOC Camembert de Normandie
  - Camembert au lait cru
  - Camembert moulé à la louche
- Isigny Saint-Mère and the AOC debate
AOC Camembert

- Camembert *pasteurized milk*
- *vs*
- AOC Camembert de Normandie *raw milk*
AOC Camembert

- AOC Camembert de Normandie
  - au lait cru
  - moulé à la louche
AOC Camembert

- Camembert de Normandie
Roquefort vs Reblochon
Patta negra di belotta vs Bayonne ham
The case of wines

- Classification of 1855: first attempt of geographic indication
- First move toward AOC, first world’s PGI, in the 1930’s
- Different indications, different qualities
  - AOC/AOP
  - (AOVDQS)
  - Vin de Pays ➔ since 2009, PGI
  - Vin de France (= vin de table)
The case of wines

- Example of Beaujolais area wines
  - Beaujolais
  - Beaujolais village
  - Beaujolais nouveau
  - Beaujolais village nouveau
  - Crus du Beaujolais
Le vignoble

Granitic soil in the north; clay and lime in South

22,000 ha, 60 millions of bottles (mais 30 in 2012...)

One grape: gamay
The Beaujolais AOCs

- beaujolais and beaujolais-supérieur
- beaujolais-village: 39 village areas (North)
  - Only these two AOC can be sold as « vin de primeur » and « beaujolais nouveau »
- 10 crus of Beaujolais
Vin « nouveau » : every wine commercialised after the 15th of December, until the following harvest (1951 law).

Vin de « primeur » : only few AOCs have the right to sell their wines before this date, as the beaujolais (3rd Thursday of November - 1985).

Carbonique maceration

Not for the **crus** of Beaujolais
The « fashion » of beaujolais nouveau

- Numbers: 35% to 55% of beaujolais wine consumed as « primeur », 36 millions de bottles of beaujolais nouveau, 40% for the export...
- The important role of Duboeuf and caricaturists
- A commercial event or a popular feast?
Two types of marketing

- In front of a new wine crisis, a double approach of the GI approach:
  - Marketing of the supply: grand cru wines, AOP
  - Marketing of the demand: other wines
Chapter VI

Applying to Korean context.
We recommend a multifunctional approach which could include the following elements, all connected between them:

- **Institutional, inter-professional, governmental labelling**
  - Geographic Indication: techniques, products, geographical environment, etc.
  - Organic farming
  - Protected natural Sites

- **Recognition of intrinsic qualities of the product:**
  - Physical qualities
  - Organoleptic Qualities: the taste

- **Validated by actors of the cuisine**
  - High gastronomy - chefs
  - Awareness of the housewife cook

- **Environmental protection: with three effects:**
  - Qualitative for the product: "organic" dimension
  - Qualitative for the nature itself
  - Hence a tourist impact

- **Development of tourism can concentrate around two aspects:**
  - Environment (cf above)
  - Small business sector & Crafts: discovery of a profession, its tools, its gestures and techniques, its history, etc.
  - Accent on the "historic depth": emphasis of the material and immaterial heritage

- **Promotion of Human Values:**
  - Sharing of the knowledge, cooperation
  - Craftsman’s passion

- **Segmentation of the offer:**
  - Different marketing strategies, different certifications
  - Varied products
  - Packaging adapted to the segments of the market

- **Adaptation of the marketing message to the approached international market: beware on the comparative advertising, on the superlative adjectives with nationalist colouring, etc.**
Merci!